Tolerance through Law

Self Governance and Group Rights
in South Tyrol

Edited by
Jens Woelk, Francesco Palermo and Joseph Marko
European Academy Bozen/Bolzano

MARTINUS
NIJHOFF
PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2008
CONTENTS

Editors' preface
Tolerance through Law ................................................. xi

PART ONE
FRAMEWORK

Chapter 1 History of the South Tyrol Conflict and its Settlement .......... 3
Emma Lantschner
I. Introduction ......................................................... 3
II. (South) Tyrol: A Land of Transit .................................. 4
III. Fascist Oppression in South Tyrol ................................. 6
IV. The First Autonomy Statute: An Unsatisfactory Solution ............. 9
V. The Second Autonomy Statute: The Powers to the Provinces .......... 13
VI. Conclusions ....................................................... 15

Chapter 2 Protection of Minorities under International Law and the
Case of South Tyrol .................................................... 17
Roberta Medda-Windschitl
I. Introduction .......................................................... 17
II. The International Anchoring of the South Tyrol Issue ................ 19
III. The International Settlement of the South Tyrol Dispute .............. 28
IV. Concluding Remarks ................................................. 30

Chapter 3 South Tyrol's Special Status within the Italian
Constitution ............................................................ 33
Francesco Palermo
I. Italian Asymmetric Regionalism and its Evolution ..................... 33
II. The 'Peripheral' Position of South Tyrol ................................ 45

PART TWO
SELF-GOVERNANCE

Chapter 4 Institutions of Self-Government ................................ 53
Giuseppe Avolio
I. Introduction .......................................................... 53
II. Institutions .......................................................... 54
Chapter 5 Legislative and Administrative Autonomy ........................................... 77
Sara Parolari and Leonard Voltmer
I. Legislative Powers ......................................................... 78
II. Administrative Powers .................................................. 94

Chapter 6 The Financial System of the Autonomous Province of Bolzano/Bozen ........................................... 105
Thomas Benedikter
I. The General Framework of Financing Italy’s Regions with a Special Statute .......... 105
II. The Financial System of the Province of Bolzano/Bozen Today ....................... 108
III. The Development of Provincial Revenues 1990–2005 .................................. 114
IV. Some Concluding Remarks ..................................................................... 117

Chapter 7 What it Means to be Special in Relations with the Central State: Institutions and Procedures ........................................... 121
Jens Wölk
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 121
II. Italy's Cooperative Regionalism: Procedures and Institutions ...................... 124
III. South Tyrol’s Special Position in Italy's Regional System .......................... 127
IV. Relations with the State in European Affairs ........................................... 136
V. Perspectives: After the Constitutional Reform of 2001 ................................. 140

Chapter 8 Implementation and Amendment of the Autonomy Statute ................. 143
Francesco Palermo
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 143
II. Implementation of the Autonomy Statute ................................................. 143
III. The Amendment Process of the Autonomy Statute ..................................... 153
IV. Looking for the Core of the South Tyrolean Autonomy ................................ 156

Chapter 9 Cross-border Cooperation between Historical Legacies and New Horizons ........................................... 161
Alice Engl and Carolin Zwillig
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 161
II. A Look Back on the Development of Cross-border Cooperation between Tyrol, South Tyrol and Trentino ........................................... 162
III. The Legal Bases for Cross-border Cooperation between Tyrol, South Tyrol and Trentino ........................................... 169
IV. Soft-Law Cooperation as Best Functioning Solution ................................... 175

Chapter 10 Regional Autonomies Providing Minority Rights and the Law of European Integration: Experiences from South Tyrol ........................................... 177
Gabriel N. Toggenburg
I. Introduction: Regional Autonomies and Minority Groups as Shadows Within the EU System ........................................... 177
II. Concrete Experiences of the South Tyrolean Autonomy ............................. 181
III. Conclusion: Regional Autonomies and Minority Groups as Increasingly Important Entities within the EU System ........................................... 197

PART THREE
MINORITY RIGHTS

Chapter 11 Individual and Group Rights in South Tyrol: Article 2
as 'Grundnorm' of the Autonomy Statute ........................................... 203
Jens Wölk
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 203
II. The Basic Compromise: the Gruber-Degasperi Agreement ......................... 204
III. The 'Grundnorm': Establishing Balances ............................................. 206
IV. From the Agreement to the Autonomy Statute: Dual Nature and Gaps ........ 208
V. Balances as Essential Core and Substance ............................................. 217

Chapter 12 Quota System, Census and Declaration of Affiliation to a Linguistic Group ........................................... 219
Emma Lantschner and Giovanni Poggeschi
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 219
II. The Quota System .................................................................... 220
III. The Normative Background to the Census and the Declaration of Linguistic Affiliation ........................................... 226
IV. Conclusions ........................................................................... 232

Chapter 13 The Educational System in South Tyrol ........................................... 235
Siegfried Baur and Roberta Medda-Windische
I. Introduction ......................................................................... 235
II. Historic and Socio-linguistic Conditions of School Policy in South Tyrol .... 238
III. Important Aspects of Education Policy since 1972 ................................... 241
IV. Foreign Pupils and the Educational System in South Tyrol ...................... 250
V. Conclusions ........................................................................... 258
Chapter 14 Linguistic Rights and the Use of Language

Cristina Fraenkel-Haeberle
I. Origins of the Problem ........................................ 259
II. Separation as the Instrument for Stabilization ................. 261
III. The Public Administration .................................... 262
IV. Trials and Proceedings ....................................... 266
V. Toponymy ......................................................... 271
VI. Forms of Protection ........................................... 274
VII. Future Prospects: the Value of Multilingualism ............ 276

Chapter 15 A 'Minority within a Minority': the Special Status of the Ladin Valleys

Günther Rauz
I. Introduction ....................................................... 279
II. Historical and Geographical Background of the Ladin in Italy 280
III. The Status of the Ladin in Italy ................................ 281
IV. The Ladin as a 'Minority within a Minority' ....... 289

Chapter 16 South Tyrol's Special Status in Private Law: the 'Entailed Farm' and the 'Grundbuch' Systems

Giovanni Poggeschi
I. Introduction ....................................................... 291
II. The System of the 'Entailed Farm', the Austrian Law of 1900 and the Act of the Province of Bolzano/Bozen of November 2001 291
III. The Legitimacy of the System of the 'Entailed Farm' According to the Constitutional Court 295
IV. The 'Grundbuch' System of Registration of Real Properties 298
V. Conclusions ......................................................... 299

PART FOUR
LESSONS TO BE LEARNED

Chapter 17 South Tyrol’s Consociational Democracy: Between Political Claim and Social Reality

Günther Pallaver
I. Consociational Democracy .................................... 303
II. The Principle of Ethnic Division ................................. 308
III. The Breaches in the Model .................................. 313
IV. The Erosion of the Logic in the System of Ethnic Separation ............................................................................ 321
V. The Tense Relationship between the Collective Rights of Minorities and Individual Rights ...................................... 324

Chapter 18 Complex Power Sharing as Conflict Resolution: South Tyrol in Comparative Perspective

Stefan Wolff
I. Introduction ....................................................... 329
II. Complex Power Sharing and Existing Theories of Conflict Resolution .................................................. 331
III. Complex Power Sharing beyond South Tyrol: an Empirical Analysis ......................................................... 339
IV. Conclusion: Complex Power Sharing Lessons from South Tyrol and Beyond .................................................. 362

Chapter 19 Is there a South Tyrolean 'Model' of Conflict Resolution to be Exported?

Joseph Marko
I. Segregation or Integration? The Main Issues Surrounding the Regulation of Conflict in the Balkans .................... 371
II. The Complementary Functions of Segregation and Integration in the South Tyrolean Model .................................. 377
III. South Tyrol on the Way to a Multi-ethnic European Region: Problems Related to the Transfer from Territorial to Functional Autonomy ................................................... 386

Appendix

Alice Engi and Alexandra Tomaselli

Editors ................................................................. 409
Authors ............................................................... 410
Index ........................................................................ 415